

The Letters of Paul as Witnesses to and for the Septuagint Text

Florian Wilk

1. Methodological Questions

The title of this article proposes the hypothesis that the letters of Paul are witnesses to the developmental history of the Septuagint text and accordingly, should be regarded as witnesses for the wording of that text in Paul's time. This can by no means be taken for granted, because recently even the basic assumption that Paul relied on a Greek version when quoting from or alluding to the Scriptures has again been called into question.¹ Admittedly, there are some problems to be solved if we intend to utilize Paul's scriptural citations and allusions as witnesses to the biblical text he used. First of all, therefore, I will discuss those methodological questions that are evoked by the title of my article.

1.1 The most fundamental question is: On what textual material should we base investigations into text types represented by the scrolls that Paul used? Is it necessary to restrict such inquiries to his quotations from Scripture?² Or are we justified in evaluating his scriptural allusions as well? A decision is not easily made. On the one hand, a comprehensive account of his use of the Scriptures can by no means be given without considering his numerous allusions; after all,

¹That Paul relied upon a Greek version was established by Emil F. Kautzsch, *De Veteris Testamenti locis a Paulo Apostolo allegatis* (Leipzig: Metzger & Wittig, 1869). Timothy Lim has recently challenged this assumption, Timothy H. Lim, *Holy Scripture in the Qumran Commentaries and Pauline Letters* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1997).

²Since we do not know to what extent Paul's addressees were able to discern his references to Scripture, the term "quotation" should only denote a scriptural citation that is marked with a quotation formula; cf. Florian Wilk, *Die Bedeutung des Jesajabuches für Paulus* (FRLANT 179; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1998), 9.

“the language of Scripture” turns up in almost every sentence he wrote.³ On the other hand, it is only with explicit citations that we are on firm ground; elsewhere we cannot be sure that it was Paul’s intention to present a Scripture excerpt to his readers. For the present purpose I think it appropriate to focus exclusively on quotations. If we want to show that the letters of Paul bear witness to the Septuagint text, this must first be demonstrated from his scriptural citations. It is only such a proof that will put us in a position to decide whether allusions may or should be examined, too.

2. Next we have to explore the issue of unambiguity. Is there clear evidence that Paul derived his scriptural quotations from a septuagintal text? In fact, such evidence can be found in several cases. Let me give just two examples:

a) *Romans 9:29*

Isa 1:9⁴

לולי יהוה צבאות
הוחיר לנו שריד כמעט
כסדם היינו
לעמרה דמינו:

If the LORD of hosts had not left us a few survivors, we would have been like Sodom, and become like Gomorrah.

Rom 9:29 = Isa 1:9⁵

(καὶ) εἰ μὴ κύριος σαβαωθ
ἔγκατέλιπεν ἡμῖν σπέρμα,
ὡς Σοδομα ἂν ἐγενήθημεν
καὶ ὡς Γομορρα ἂν ὁμοιωθήμεν.

If the Lord of hosts had not left seed to us, we would have fared like Sodom and been made like Gomorrah. (NRSV modified)

This citation of Isa 1:9 corresponds to the wording of the Septuagint but deviates from the Hebrew text at two points: instead of שריד, “survivor,” which is mostly rendered by cognates of the verbs λείπω, “to leave,” σώζω, “to save,” or φεύγω, “to flee,” it has σπέρμα, “seed,” thereby taking up the exceptional equivalence established in Deut 3:3.⁶ Moreover it lacks a counterpart to the next expression, כמעט.⁷

³ The phrase “language of Scripture” comes from, Christopher D. Stanley, *Paul and the Language of Scripture: Citation Technique in the Pauline Epistles and Contemporary Literature* (SNTSMS 74; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

⁴ Quoted from *BHS*.

⁵ Quoted from Eberhard Nestle et al., NA²⁷; and Joseph Ziegler, *Isaias* (3d ed.; Septuaginta 14; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1983).

⁶ The omission of the initial καὶ is a standard feature of Paul’s scriptural citations; cf. e.g., Rom 9:27; 10:11; 11:26; 15:12.

⁷ This can either be interpreted as an apposition to שריד meaning “few,” or as an introductory phrase to v. 9b meaning “almost.”

b) Galatians 4:27

Isa 54:1

רני עקרה לא ילדה
פצחי רנה וצהלי
לא-חלה
כירבים בני-שוממה
מבני בעולה
אמר יהוה:

Sing, O barren one who did not bear;
burst into song and shout, you who
have not been in labor! For the
children of the desolate woman will
be more than the children of her that
is married, says the LORD.

Gal 4:27 = Isa 54:1

εὐφράνθητι, στεῖρα ἢ οὐ τίκτουσα,
ῥῆξον καὶ βόησον
ἢ οὐκ ᾠδίνουσα·
ὅτι πολλὰ τὰ τέκνα τῆς ἐρήμου
μᾶλλον ἢ τῆς ἐχούσης τὸν ἄνδρα
(εἶπεν γὰρ κύριος).

Rejoice, you childless one, you who
bear no children, burst into song and
shout, you who endure no birth
pangs; for the children of the
desolate woman are more numerous
than those of the one who is married.
(NRSV modified)

Here Paul has quoted Isa 54:1. Again his quotation follows the Septuagint while differing from the Hebrew text: equivalents both to the verb **יצהלי**, “and exult,” and to the second **בני**, “children,” are missing, and the noun **בעולה**, “wife,” has not been translated but rather has been paraphrased by *ἡ ἔχουσα τὸν ἄνδρα*.⁸

Citations like these are obviously taken from the Septuagint. It is very probable, therefore, that the Greek text constitutes the source of all those quotations that are in agreement with its wording, even if they show no variation from the Hebrew.

3. The majority of Paul’s scriptural citations, however, deviate from the wording of the Septuagint in one way or another. So, if we still wish to prove their usability as witnesses to the Septuagint text, we need to rule out the possibility that Paul consulted other Greek versions or did his own translations from the Hebrew. In actual fact, this is only feasible by means of analyzing each quotation separately. There is one phenomenon, though, that makes the possibility just mentioned rather implausible. Several times Paul combined or assembled two citations with one following the Septuagint and the other one showing a different reading. A good example can be found in Rom 10:15–16:

⁸ Paul consistently omitted opening and concluding formulae to his scriptural quotations; cf. e.g., Rom 9:33 (Isa 28:16); 11:27a (Isa 59:21). As for **יצהלי**, cf. the addition of *καὶ τέρπου*, “and cheer,” in some LXX manuscripts and in the Theodotion version (86; Eusebius), as cited in the apparatus of the critical edition (Ziegler, *Isaias*). This addition indicates that *ῥῆξον καὶ βόησον* must be regarded as a translation of **פצחי רנה**.

Table 9. Romans 10:15–16 and its sources

Isa 52:7; 53:1	Rom 10:15–16	Isa 52:7; 53:1
	15 πῶς δὲ κηρύξωσιν ἂν μὴ ἀποσταλώσιν; καθὼς γέγραπται·	(6 ... πάρειμι)
	מִה־נְאוֹי עַל־הַרְרִים רְגְלֵי מַבְשֵׁר מַשְׁמִיעַ שְׁלוֹם מַבְשֵׁר שׁוֹב	7 ὡς ὄρα ἐπὶ τῶν ὄρέων, ὡς πόδες εὐαγγελιζομένου ἀκοῆν εἰρήνης, ὡς εὐαγγελιζόμενος ἀγαθὰ ...
	... 16 'Ἄλλ' οὐ πάντες ὑπήκουσαν τῷ εὐαγγελίῳ. 'Ἡσαΐας γὰρ λέγει·	
	מִי הָאֲמִין לְשִׁמְעָתָו	1 κύριε, τίς ἐπίστευσεν τῇ ἀκοῇ ἡμῶν;
52:7 How beautiful upon the mountains are the feet of the messenger who announces peace, who brings good news, ...	15 And how are they to proclaim him unless they are sent? As it is written, "How beautiful are the feet of those who bring good news!"	like season upon the mountains, like the feet of one bring glad tidings of good things
53:1 Who has believed what we have heard?	16 But not all have obeyed the good news; for Isaiah says, "Lord, who has believed what we have heard" (NRSV modified) ⁹	Lord, who has believed our report?

The quotation in v. 16 was evidently taken from the Septuagint given that the opening vocative κύριε has no basis in the Hebrew text. The one in v. 15 diverges from it, however, particularly with regard to the sentence construction, which resembles the Hebrew text. It is almost unimaginable, however, that in the course of writing just two verses, Paul would have used two different versions of a single passage from Scripture. Now, if Paul had rejected the septuagintal rendering of Isa 52:7 in order to cite the verse more in agreement with the Hebrew, he would also have had to omit the surplus vocative κύριε in his quotation from Isa 53:1. Therefore, the most probable hypothesis is that both citations were derived from a septuagintal text that was available to Paul.

⁹ With Paul, ἀκοή means a message that is heard, cf. Gal 3:2, 5; 1 Thess 2:13. In Rom 10:16, therefore, ἡμῶν must be interpreted as an obj. gen., so that Isaiah is presented by Paul as speaking on behalf of Israel (cf. Rom 9:29).

As for Isa 52:7, this hypothesis is substantiated by two facts. First, the individual words in Paul's quotation are mostly the same as in the Septuagint; thus, it seems to have its origin in a revised septuagintal text rather than in a different version. Secondly, some witnesses to the Lucianic recension even present this verse in a form that comes close to the Hebrew parent and at the same time is similar to the wording of Rom 10:15.¹⁰

Table 10. Romans 10:15 and sources

Isa 52:7	Rom 10:15	Isa 52:7 (Lucianic MSS)
מה־נִאוּ עַל־הַהַרִים	ὡς ὄρατοι	ὡς ὄρατοι ἐπὶ τῶν ὄρέων
רְגֵלִי	οἱ πόδες	(οἱ) πόδες
מְבַשֵּׂר	τῶν εὐαγγελιζομένων	εὐαγγελιζομένου
מְשַׂמֵּעַ שְׁלוֹם מְבַשֵּׂר		ἀκοὴν εἰρήνης εὐαγγελιζομένου
... טוֹב	[τὰ] ἀγαθά.	ἀγαθά ...

4. Nonetheless, as in many other cases significant differences remain. In order to determine their origin we have to clarify the principles of Paul's citation technique. The first question to be settled in this respect is, did he usually reproduce verbatim the text from which he quoted, or did he take the liberty of modifying it. Since that text is accessible to us only through his citations, a well-founded answer seems almost impossible. One peculiar feature of his method of quoting, however, brings us closer to such an answer. Now and then Paul has woven together two distinct quotes from Scripture so as to present them in only one citation. His procedure can be illustrated from Rom 11:26–27:

¹⁰ According to Ziegler, *Isaias*, these witnesses are the Lucianic manuscripts 22^c, 62, 90–130–311, 456, as well as 86^c, 403, 613, and the commentary by Theodoret.

Table 11. Romans 11:26–27 and sources

Isa 59:20–21	Rom 11:26–27	Isa 27:9
καὶ ἦξει ἔνεκεν Σιων ὁ ρυόμενος καὶ ἀποστρέψει ἀσεβείας ἀπὸ Ἰακωβ, καὶ αὕτη αὐτοῖς ἢ παρ' ἐμοῦ διαθήκη, εἶπεν κύριος·	... γέγραπται γάρ· ἦξει ἐκ Σιων ὁ ρυόμενος, ἀποστρέψει ἀσεβείας ἀπὸ Ἰακωβ, καὶ αὕτη αὐτοῖς ἢ παρ' ἐμοῦ διαθήκη, ὅταν ἀφέλωμαι τὰς ἀμαρτίας αὐτῶν.	διὰ τοῦτο ἀφαιρεθήσεται ἡ ἀνομία Ἰακωβ, καὶ τοῦτό ἐστιν ἡ εὐλογία αὐτοῦ, ὅταν ἀφέλωμαι αὐτοῦ τὴν ἀμαρτίαν, ὅταν θώσιν πάντας τοὺς λίθους τῶν βωμῶν κατακεκομμένους ὡς κονίαν λεπτήν· ...
τὸ πνεῦμα τὸ ἐμὸν ... καὶ τὰ ῥήματα, ἃ ἔδωκα ..., οὐ μὴ ἐκλίπῃ ἐκ τοῦ στόματός σου as it is written, “Out of Zion will come the Deliverer; he will banish ungodliness from Jacob; and this is my covenant with them, that I will have taken away then their sins.” (NRSV modified)	Because of this the transgression of Iakob will be removed. And this is his blessing, when I remove his sin, when they make all the stones of the altars broken pieces like fine dust....
my spirit ... and my words that I have put ..., shall not fail out of your mouth....		

In Isa 59, v. 21 defines God’s covenant as the promise that the spirit and words of God would stay with Israel forever. In Paul’s quotation, this definition has been replaced by a sentence taken from Isa 27:9 that defines Israel’s eschatological blessing as the forgiveness of its sin. The effect is that the quotation as a whole focuses on God’s bestowing a merciful covenant upon the people of Israel.¹¹ In this way it exactly matches the preceding prophecy of Rom 11:26 that “all Israel will be saved.” In all probability therefore the conflation of the

¹¹ Cf. J. Ross Wagner, *Heralds of the Good News: Isaiah and Paul ‘In Concert’ in the Letter to the Romans* (NovTSup 101; Leiden: Brill, 2002), 294: “... by replacing the last half of Isa 59:21, Paul keeps the focus on the *fact* of Israel’s redemption rather than pausing to consider its *effects*.”

Isaianic oracles originated with Paul.¹² From this we can safely conclude that he had no inhibitions about altering the wording of his quotations.

5. Given the thematic and structural similarity between those two passages from Isaiah, however, it is conceivable that the substitution of clauses goes back simply to a slip of memory. Thus, we have to ask a further question about Paul's citation technique: can we be sure about his intentional adaptation of scriptural quotations to his own arguments? Or should we rather presume a Pauline practice of rendering passages from Scripture freely? The latter presumption, though, seems to be without foundation in the letters of Paul. First, there is no doubt that he was capable of reproducing a given text word for word even if it was quite long; the citations in Rom 9:29 and in Gal 4:27 already mentioned suffice as evidence. Secondly, virtually every change to the wording of his quotations can be explained by his respective purposes in quoting from Scripture. This is clear, for instance, in Rom 10:11:

Table 12. Romans 10:11–13 and sources

Rom 10:11–13	Isa 28:16
λέγει γὰρ ἡ γραφή:	... ἐμβαλῶ εἰς τὰ θεμέλια Σιων λίθον
πᾶς
ὁ πιστεύων	καὶ ὁ πιστεύων
ἐπ' αὐτῷ οὐ κατασχινηθήσεται.	ἐπ' αὐτῷ οὐ μὴ κατασχινηθῆ.
οὐ γὰρ ἐστὶν διαστολή Ἰουδαίου τε	
καὶ Ἑλλήνου, ὁ γὰρ αὐτὸς κύριος	
πάντων, πλουτῶν εἰς πάντας τοὺς	
ἐπικαλουμένους αὐτόν·	
πᾶς γὰρ ὃς ἂν ἐπικαλέσῃται τὸ ὄνομα	
κυρίου σωθήσεται.	
	... I will lay for the foundations of
The scripture says,	Sion a ... stone
'No one
who believes	and the one who believes in him will
in him will be put to shame.'	not be put to shame.

By inserting πᾶς, “everyone,” at the beginning of the citation and by altering the mood of the concluding verb, Paul suited his quotation to the prophecy that is taken verbatim from Joel 2:32 (MT 3:5) in v. 13: “For, ‘every one who calls upon the name of the Lord will be saved.’” He also underlined the universal scope of salvation in Christ asserted in v. 12: “For there is no distinction between Jew and Greek; the same Lord is Lord of all and bestows his riches upon all who call upon him.”

¹² *Contra* Stanley, *Paul and the Language of Scripture*, 169–70, who attributes it to a pre-Pauline Jewish tradition.

Another more complicated example is the quotation in Rom 14:11:

Table 13. Romans 14:9–11 and sources

<p>Rom 14:9–11 εἰς τοῦτο γὰρ Χριστὸς ἀπέθανεν καὶ ἔζησεν, ἵνα καὶ νεκρῶν καὶ ζώντων κυριεύσῃ. Σὺ δὲ τί κρίνεις τὸν ἀδελφόν σου; ... πάντες γὰρ παραστησόμεθα τῷ βήματι τοῦ θεοῦ,¹¹ γέγραπται γάρ· ζῶ ἐγὼ, λέγει κύριος, ὅτι ἐμοὶ κάμψει πᾶν γόνυ καὶ πᾶσα γλῶσσα ἔξομολογήσεται τῷ θεῷ.</p>	<p>Isa 45:23 κατ' ἔμαντοῦ ὀμνύω Ἥ μὴν ἐξελεύσεται ἐκ τοῦ στόματός μου δικαιοσύνη, οἱ λόγοι μου οὐκ ἀποστραφήσονται ὅτι ἐμοὶ κάμψει πᾶν γόνυ καὶ ἔξομολογήσεται πᾶσα γλῶσσα τῷ θεῷ.</p>
---	---

for it is written, 'As I live, says the Lord, every knee shall bow to me, and every tongue shall give praise to God.' because to me every knee shall bow, and every tongue shall confess to God

Paul has not only reversed the position of words in the second half of the sentence but also replaced the elongated introduction to God's oath in Isa 45 by a shorter and more common formula.¹³ Both modifications intend to align the quotation with Paul's train of thought. By changing the word order, on the one hand, he gave the parallelism a chiasmic structure emphasizing the twice repeated *πᾶς*, and thereby linked the citation to his own comment at the end of v. 10: "For we shall all stand before the judgment seat of God." On the other hand, the formula chosen created a double connection with v. 9: "For to this end Christ died and lived again, that he might be Lord both of the dead and of the living." There the verbs *ζάω* and *κυριεύω* are used with *Χριστός* as subject. Therefore, the risen Christ becomes the speaker of the Isaianic oracle quoted in v. 11.¹⁴

¹³ This formula appears in Num 14:28 and several times within prophetic books of the LXX. Since it is connected with divergent actions of God, it carries no definite intention in itself. It is therefore not possible to determine a single reference in Scripture as Paul's source (*contra* Dietrich-Alex Koch, *Die Schrift als Zeuge des Evangeliums: Untersuchungen zur Verwendung und zum Verständnis der Schrift bei Paulus* [BHT 69; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1986], 184–85, who traces the formula back to Isa 49:18).

¹⁴ Cf. Ulrich Wilckens, *Der Brief an die Römer: Röm 12–16* (EKKNT 6.3; Zürich: Benziger, 1982), 85.

Similar observations can be made on Paul's other quotations. Accordingly, deviations from the septuagintal text should be attributed to him only if they match his intention in quoting from the Scriptures.

6. A final question needs to be answered. My reasoning up until now has been based on the assumption that Paul took his citations from whole Septuagint texts. In this matter it makes no difference whether he used written texts or recalled the material from memory. If he resorted to a Jewish or early Christian anthology of excerpted Scripture passages, however, his quotations would only attest a secondhand text and could then not be utilized as witnesses to the Septuagint text. The use of such an anthology on Paul's part, however, seems unlikely for the following reason: the context around nearly every citation includes phrases and statements that are reminiscent of the contexts to which the passages originally belong. The catena of quotations in Rom 15:9–12 is a good illustration of this.¹⁵

¹⁵ In the following table for reasons of space, I have left out the quotations themselves from the Romans passage and have only marked them (printed in bold) in the columns showing their respective contexts in the Scriptures.

Table 14. Romans 15:7–14 and sources

Ps 17:47–51 47 ... ὑψωθήτω ὁ θεὸς τῆς <u>σωτηρίας μου</u> , 48 ὁ θεὸς ὁ ... ὑποτάξας λαοὺς ὑπ' ἐμέ, 49 ὁ ῥύστης μου ... 50 διὰ τοῦτο ἐξομολογήσομαι σοι ἐν ἔθνεσιν, κύριε, καὶ τῷ δυνάμει σου ψαλλῶ, 51 μεγαλύνων τὰς σωτηρίας τοῦ βασιλέως αὐτοῦ καὶ ποιῶν ἔλεος τῷ <u>Χριστῷ αὐτοῦ</u> τῷ Δαυιδ καὶ τῷ σπέρματι αὐτοῦ ἕως αἰῶνος.	Deut 32:43 εὐφράνθητε, οὐρανοί, ἅμα αὐτῷ, καὶ προσκυνη- σάτωσαν αὐτῷ πάντες υἱοὶ θεοῦ· εὐφράνθητε, ἔθνη, μετὰ τοῦ λαοῦ αὐτοῦ, καὶ ἐνισχυ- σάτωσαν αὐτῷ πάντες ἄγγελοι θεοῦ· ὅτι τὸ αἷμα τῶν υἱῶν αὐτοῦ ἐκδικᾶται, ... καὶ ἐκκαθαριεῖ κύριος τὴν γῆν τοῦ λαοῦ αὐτοῦ.	Rom 15:7–14 7 διὸ προσλαμβάνεσθε ἄλλήλους, καθὼς καὶ ὁ Χριστὸς προσελάβετο ἡμᾶς εἰς δόξαν τοῦ θεοῦ. 8 λέγω γὰρ Χριστὸν διάκονον γενενησθαι περιτομῆς ὑπὲρ <u>ἀληθείας</u> <u>θεοῦ</u> , εἰς τὸ βεβαιῶσαι τὰς ἐπαγγελίας τῶν πατέρων, 9 τὰ δὲ ἔθνη ὑπὲρ <u>ἐλέους</u> <u>δοξάσαι</u> τὸν θεόν, <u>καθὼς</u> <u>γέγραπται</u> : ... 13 ὁ δὲ θεὸς τῆς ἐλπίδος πληρώσει ἡμᾶς πάσης χαρᾶς καὶ εἰρήνης ... 14 πέπεισμαι ... ὅτι καὶ αὐτοὶ μεστοὶ ἐστε <u>ἀγαθωσύνης</u> , <u>πεπληρωμένοι</u> <u>πάσης [τῆς]</u> <u>γνώσεως</u> , ...	Ps 116 Ἀλληλουια. αἰνεῖτε τὸν κύριον, πάντα τὰ ἔθνη, ἐπαινεσάτωσαν αὐτόν, πάντες οἱ λαοί, 2 ὅτι ἐκραταιώθη τὸ <u>ἔλεος αὐτοῦ</u> ἐφ' ἡμᾶς, καὶ <u>ἡ ἀλήθεια</u> <u>τοῦ κυρίου</u> μένει εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα.	Isa 11:9–12:2 9 καὶ οὐ μὴ <u>κακοποιήσωσιν</u> ... ἐπὶ τὸ ὄρος ... μου, ὅτι <u>ἐνεπλήσθη</u> ἡ <u>σύμπασα τοῦ</u> <u>γινῶναι</u> τὸν κύριον ὡς ὕδωρ πολύ κατακαλύψαι θαλάσσας. 10 καὶ ἔσται ἐν τῇ ἡμέρᾳ ἐκείνῃ ἡ <u>ῥίζα</u> τοῦ <u>Ἰεσοῦ</u> καὶ ὁ ἀνιστάμενος ἄρχων ἐθνῶν, ἐπ' αὐτῷ ἔθνη ἐλπιούσιν, καὶ ἔσται ἡ ἀνάπαυσις αὐτοῦ <u>τιμῆ</u> . 11 ... 12 καὶ ἀρεῖ σημεῖον εἰς τὰ ἔθνη καὶ συνάξει τοὺς ἀπολομένους <u>Ἰσραὴλ</u> ... 13 ... Εφραιμ οὐ ζηλώσει Ἰουδαν καὶ Ἰουδας οὐ θλίψει Εφραιμ. 14–16 ... 1 ... <u>ἠλέησάς με</u> . 2 ... <u>διότι ἡ</u> <u>δόξα μου</u> ... κύριος ...
--	---	---	---	---

There are numerous connections among those four passages from which the quotes in Romans were taken, but these connections could also be explained by recourse to the theory of a pre-Pauline collection of quotations. In addition to the

links among the citations, however, the preceding and following verses in Rom 15 show verbal links to the scriptural passages in question. Most important is the congruence between vv. 8–9 and Ps 116(117):2 (“For his mercy on us has gained strength, and the faithfulness of the Lord endures for ever”) through the combination of ἀλήθεια and ἔλεος.¹⁶ The latter word is mentioned in Ps 17(18):51 (“who increases the saving acts of his king and shows mercy through his anointed, David, and his offspring for ever”), too, and there it is defined as God’s mercy that is put into effect by God’s Messiah.¹⁷ Furthermore, Paul’s appeal to the Gentiles to praise God in v. 9a points back to Isa 12:1–2 (“... you had mercy on me. 2 ... for my glory ... is the Lord”) and perhaps also to the last clause in Isa 11:10 (“and his rest will be glory”).¹⁸ Paul’s statement in v. 14 (“I am satisfied ... that you yourselves are full of goodness, filled with all knowledge ...”), again, seems to pick up the prophecy of Isa 11:9 (“They will do no evil ... on my holy mountain; for the whole [world] will be full of the knowledge of the Lord as much water [that is made] to cover the seas.”). Many thematic links can easily be noted as well. Paul’s call for mutual acceptance in v. 7 (“Welcome one another, therefore, as Christ has welcomed you, for the glory of God.”), for instance, recalls the prediction of peace between Ephraim and Judah in Isa 11:13; the link between human’s and Christ’s conduct in that same verse resembles the connection between human and heavenly joy in Deut 32:43; etc. From such a bulk of evidence we can confidently infer that Paul was well acquainted with the original contexts of his quotations, and this strongly suggests that their source lies in complete Septuagint books.

2. Citations in Letters of Paul

We have now cleared the ground for analyzing the citations that Paul uses from the Scriptures as witnesses to the Septuagint text. By means of ascertaining the function of a given quotation in its Pauline context it is possible to identify those variations that underline its relevance for his argument and should consequently

¹⁶Cf. Allan M. Harmon, “Paul’s Use of the Psalms” (Th.D. diss., Westminster Theological Seminary, 1968), 121. As is indicated by Rom 15:8b, Paul took ἀλήθεια to mean God’s faithfulness to Israel.

¹⁷With the phrase ποιῆν ἔλεος, at least in Paul’s view, τῷ χριστῷ should be read as an instrumental dative (cf. as an analogy Rom 11:30b: νῦν δὲ ἠλεήθητε τῇ τούτων ἀπειθείᾳ) meaning Christ as David’s offspring.

¹⁸According to Eusebius and Procopius, both Aquila and Symmachus translated כבוד in Isa 11:10 as δόξα. In fact, this is the regular equivalent of the Hebrew word in the Septuagint version of Isaiah. It may well be, therefore, that Paul referred to a septuagintal text of Isa 11 that had been corrected after the Hebrew (see §2, below). The verbal link with Rom 15:9 would then be apparent.

be attributed to his editorial work. In this way we can reconstruct the text of the manuscripts that he used with a good level of confidence. The wording obtained may then serve as a witness for a particular form of the Septuagint text in Paul's time. However, when we compile individual findings and try to determine the text types represented by Paul's quotations, we need to proceed with caution. First, of course, this can only be done separately for each and every book he used. Moreover, we must also reckon on Paul using different scrolls at various times and in various places.

It goes without saying that it would be beyond the scope of this article to deal with every Pauline quotation. Therefore, I shall briefly present the results of research that has been done on those from the book of Isaiah.¹⁹

1. In twenty-one quotations Paul integrated twenty Isaianic quotes into his letters; fifteen appear in Romans, three in 1 Corinthians, one in 2 Corinthians, and one in Galatians. In three places the Pauline citation shows a text that deviates considerably from the Septuagint tradition: in Rom 9:33 (Isa 8:14: "a stone that will make men stumble and a rock that will make them fall"), as well as in 1 Cor 14:21 (Isa 28:11–12) and 15:54 (Isa 25:8). Each time, the Greek version seems to have been reworked in order to align it with the Hebrew text. Each time, again, this version concurs more or less with one of the translations done by Aquila, Symmachus, and Theodotion.²⁰ In regard to Isa 8:14 there is also agreement with its quotation in 1 Pet 2:8.²¹ Almost the same applies to the quotation from Isa 52:7 in Rom 10:15 already mentioned, with the exception that even a few Septuagint manuscripts are close to what Paul seems to have had at hand. In these four cases, then, his letters apparently bear witness to a septuagintal text that has been extensively revised towards the Hebrew.²²

I hasten to add that the Hebrew *Vorlage* must not simply be identified with the MT. First, the revision might have presupposed a different vocalization. This

¹⁹ Cf. David R. Denny, "The Significance of Isaiah in the Writings of Paul." (ThD diss., New Orleans Baptist Theological Seminary, 1985); Koch, *Die Schrift als Zeuge des Evangeliums*; Douglas A. Oss, "Paul's Use of Isaiah and Its Place in His Theology with Special Reference to Romans 9–11." (PhD diss., Westminster Theological Seminary, 1992); Stanley, *Paul and the Language of Scripture*; Wilk, *Die Bedeutung des Jesajabuches für Paulus*; Wagner, *Heralds of the Good News*; Shiu-Lun Shum, *Paul's Use of Isaiah in Romans: A Comparative Study of Paul's Letter to the Romans and the Sibylline and Qumran Sectarian Texts* (WUNT 156; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2002).

²⁰ 1 Cor 15:54 concurs exactly with Theodotion's version of Isa 25:8 (according to the Codex Marchalianus [Q]). Rom 9:33 concurs roughly with Symmachus's version of Isa 8:14 (according to Eusebius). As to 1 Cor 14:21, Origen comments on his quotation in *Philocalia* 9.2: Εὐρον γὰρ τὰ ἰσοδυναμοῦντα τῇ λέξει ταύτῃ ἐν τῇ τοῦ Ἀκύλου ἐρμηνείᾳ κείμενα (cf. Ziegler, *Isaias*).

²¹ Cf. Jobes's discussion of this quote, pp. 323–24.

²² Cf. Wilk, *Die Bedeutung des Jesajabuches für Paulus*, 20–30, 41–42.

is obviously the case with Paul's quotation in 1 Cor 15:54 from Isa 25:8 in which the verb בלע had been read as a *pu^cal* form, as also happened in the Theodotion and Peshitta versions.²³

Table 15. 1 Corinthians 15:54 and sources

Isa 25:8(7)	Theodotion [Q]	1 Cor 15:54	Isa 25:8
		... τότε γενήσεται ὁ λόγος ὁ γεγραμμένος·	
בלע	κατεπόθη	κατεπόθη	κατέπιεν
המוח	ὁ θάνατος	ὁ θάνατος	ὁ θάνατος
לנצח	εἰς νίκος ...	εἰς νίκος.	ἰσχύσας ...
		... then shall come to pass the saying that is written: 'Death is swallowed up in victory.'	Death, having prevailed, swallowed them up....
he will swallow up death forever			

Secondly, a revision could even have been carried out on the basis of a text with different consonants. This is probably the best way to account for Paul's citation from Isa 28:11–12 in 1 Cor 14:21.

Table 16. 1 Corinthians 14:21 and sources

Isa 28:11–12	1 Cor 14:21	Isa 28:11–12
	ἐν τῷ νόμῳ γέγραπται כִּי ὅτι	
בלעני שפה	ἐν ἑτερογλώσσοις	διὰ Φαυλισμὸν χειλέων
ובלשון אחרת	καὶ ἐν χεῖλεσιν ἑτέρων	διὰ Γλώσσης ἑτέρας,
ידבר אל-העם הזה:	λαλήσω τῷ λαῷ τούτῳ	ὅτι λαλήσουσιν τῷ λαῷ τούτῳ
אשר אמר אליהם		λέγοντες αὐτῷ
זאת המנוחה הניחו		Τοῦτο τὸ Ἀνάπαυμα τῷ πεινῶντι
לעין זואח המרגעה		καὶ Τοῦτο τὸ Σύντριμμα,
ולא אבוא	καὶ οὐδ' οὕτως	καὶ Οὐκ ἠθέλησαν
שמוע:	εἰσακούσονται μου,	ἀκούειν.
	λέγει κύριος.	

²³ Cf. *BHS*.

<p>Truly, with stammering lip and with alien tongue he will speak to this people, to whom he has said, “This is rest; give rest to the weary; and this is repose”; yet they would not hear.</p>	<p>In the law it is written, ‘By men of strange tongues and by the lips of foreigners will I speak to this people, and even then they will not listen to me, says the Lord.’</p>	<p>... because of contempt from lips, through a different tongue; Because they will speak to this people, saying to them, “This is the rest for the hungry, and this is the destruction”; yet they would not hear.</p>
---	--	--

As one can see, the version of Isa 28:11 given in 1 Cor 14:21 sticks much closer to the Hebrew than that of the Septuagint.²⁴ The inference, however, that Paul quoted from a revised edition of the Septuagint seems to be flawed by his rendering of Isa 28:12b; in fact, the Septuagint translation of this sentence could scarcely have been more accurate. If we delete the final letter from the word אָבוֹרָא in accordance with many Hebrew manuscripts, however, the possibility arises that the writer of the text from which Paul took the quote read or interpreted וְלֹא אָבוֹרָא שְׁמוֹעַ, “and they would not hear,” as וְלֹא כֵן שְׁמוֹעַ, “and even this way they do not hear,” skipping one א, replacing בוּ by כֵּן, and changing וְעַיִן to עַיִן.²⁵ This quotation would then be evidence of the variability of the Hebrew text in Paul’s time.

2. In addition to those four citations discussed above, there are five others that testify to an effort to bring the original Greek wording nearer to the Hebrew at certain points while stopping short of great alterations. All of them are found in Rom 9–11: in Isa 27:9 (Rom 11:27) and 65:1 (Rom 10:20) the word order has been rearranged; and in Isa 10:22–23 (Rom 9:27–28), 28:16 (Rom 9:33), and 59:20–21 (Rom 11:26–27) individual words have been replaced. With the exception of the latter reference, all modifications also occur in Hexaplaric manuscripts or, as for Isa 28:16, in its quotation in 1 Pet 2:6.²⁶ It seems reasonable to infer that Paul, while making preparations for his treatise on “The gospel and Israel,” had access to a septuagintal text that was sprinkled with such minor corrections toward the Hebrew.²⁷

3. Of the remaining eleven quotations scattered over Romans, 1 Corinthians, 2 Corinthians, and Galatians each shows a wording that is well

²⁴ Paul only changed the third person of the verb into the first, and with that modification and the addition of λέγει κύριος at the end of Isa 28:12, he made clear who the speaker of Isa 28:11 was. He also deleted v. 12a, which would have been out of place in his argument in 1 Cor 14:20–25.

²⁵ As for the word אָבוֹרָא, cf. *BHS*.

²⁶ Cf. Jobes in this volume, pp. 319–22.

²⁷ For details, see *ibid.*, 31–42.

attested in the Septuagint tradition. Interestingly enough, at least six of them contain rather significant deviations from the Hebrew.²⁸

4. The alternatives arising from these data are as follows: either Paul's citations originated from at least three different versions of the Septuagint, or its revision toward the Hebrew had not been carried out consistently. A decision is hard to make, all the more because a reflection on the question of documentation does not help. Often the textual basis of Paul's citations is unanimously testified by most Septuagint manuscripts.²⁹ It is true that when the manuscript from which he quotes follows a distinct strand of the textual tradition, it agrees with Alexandrian witnesses.³⁰ But this goes merely for four out of twenty Isaianic quotes, and in one case the wording of Paul's citation at the same time diverges from those witnesses in another respect.³¹ Moreover, two Pauline quotations show minor deviations from Codex Alexandrinus.³² In addition, if we group them all according to the manuscripts that attest to their respective wordings, the groups emerging are not in agreement with the three groups that have been formed in comparison with the Hebrew.

We must be content, therefore, to differentiate the Isaianic words cited in Rom 9–11 that indicate a guarded revision of the Septuagint towards the Hebrew, from Paul's remaining divergent quotations. It may well be that both alternatives named above hold true.

²⁸ Cf. Rom 2:24 (Isa 52:5); 10:16 (53:1); 14:11 (45:23); 15:12 (11:10); 15:21 (52:15); 1 Cor 1:19 (29:14). Deviations from the MT are also to be found in Rom 9:29 (Isa 1:9); 10:21 (65:2); Gal 4:27 (54:1); in these cases, however, the LXX text that is quoted may correspond to the original Hebrew wording. Only the citations in Rom 11:8 (Isa 29:10) and 2 Cor 6:2 (49:8) are in obvious accordance with the Hebrew parent.

²⁹ Cf. Isa 29:10 (Rom 11:8); 29:14 (1 Cor 1:19); 49:8 (2 Cor 6:2); 52:5 (Rom 2:24 [although ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσι, "among the Gentiles," falls under the obelus in B–Q et al. and is omitted in V]); 52:15 (Rom 15:21); 53:1 (Rom 10:16); 54:1 (Gal 4:27); 65:2 (Rom 10:21 [although καὶ ἀντιλέγοντα, "and contrary," falls under the obelus in B–Q et al.]). The same applies—as far as Paul's copy of Isaiah concurs with the textual tradition of the Septuagint—to most of those quotations that testify to a revision of the Greek text toward the Hebrew: cf. Isa 8:14 (Rom 9:33); 25:8 (1 Cor 15:54); 27:9 (Rom 11:27); 28:11–12 (1 Cor 14:21); 52:7 (Rom 10:15); 59:20–21 (Rom 11:26–27).

³⁰ Emphasized by Koch, *Die Schrift als Zeuge des Evangeliums*, 48–50; and Wagner, *Heralds of the Good News*, 24 n. 86; cf. Ziegler's comment on the Alexandrian text in his edition (*Isaias*, 21–36).

³¹ Agreeing with Alexandrian witnesses: Rom 9:27–28 (Isa 10:22–23: skipping αὐτῶν after κατὰ-ὑπόλειμμα with A–Q et al.); 9:33; 10:11 (Isa 28:16: reading ἐπ' αὐτῶ with S A–Q et al.); 14:11 (Isa 45:23: reading ἐξομολογήσεται ... τῷ θεῷ with A–Q et al.); 10:20 (Isa 65:1: reading ἐγενόμην with A et al.). Diverging from the Alexandrian witnesses: Rom 9:27–28 (Isa 10:22–23: reading κύριος instead of ὁ θεός with B–V et al.).

³² Rom 9:29 (Isa 1:9: A–Q* read ὁμοιώθημεν); 15:12 (Isa 11:10: A reads ἔθνω).

5. Just to sum up:

a) A close analysis of Paul's citation technique backs up the hypothesis put forward in the title of this article: since his quotations were taken from the Septuagint they are indeed important witnesses for the form of its text in the first century C.E.

b) Their respective wordings may, however, be utilized as witnessing to the Septuagint tradition only after determining Paul's alterations to the texts upon which he depends for his quotes.

c) Paul's quotations from Isaiah show a certain, though not consistent, tendency towards the Alexandrian text type, and they testify to an ongoing process of scribal work on the Septuagint that was intended to align it with the Hebrew text.

3. Conclusion

In conclusion, I would like to make the following points:

1. An analysis of the other quotations from Scripture contained in Paul's letters will, as far as I can see, lead to similar conclusions. At any rate, some citations from the Pentateuch correspond to the text given in the Codex Alexandrinus. Compare, e.g., those from Gen 21:10 in Gal 4:30 ("But what does the scripture say? 'Cast out the slave and her son; for the son of the slave shall not inherit with the son of the free woman'"), and from Exod 9:16 in Rom 9:17 ("For the scripture says to Pharaoh, 'I have raised you up for the very purpose of showing my power in you, so that my name may be proclaimed in all the earth'").³³ Some citations, again, attest to a revision of the Septuagint Greek on the basis of the Hebrew. Examples of that are to be found in 1 Cor 3:19 (quoting Job 5:12–13), Rom 11:4 (quoting 3 Kgdms 19:18), and 12:19 (quoting Deut 32:35).³⁴

2. The results obtained by analyzing Paul's scriptural quotations call for corresponding investigations into his allusions. After all, he had a thorough

³³ Reading μή after οὐ γάρ and skipping ταύτης after παιδίσκης in Gen 21:10; reading δύνανται in Exod 9:16. Cf. Koch, *Die Schrift als Zeuge des Evangeliums*, 53.

³⁴ On 1 Cor 3:19, cf. Berndt Schaller, "Zum Textcharakter der Hiobzitate im paulinischen Schrifttum," *ZNW* 71 (1980): 21–26 = "Zum Textcharakter der Hiobzitate im paulinischen Schrifttum," in *Fundamenta Judaica: Studien zum antiken Judentum und zum Neuen Testament* (ed. L. Doering and A. Steudel; SUNT 25; Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2001). On Rom 11:4 cf. Christopher D. Stanley, "The Significance of Romans 11:3–4 for the Text History of the LXX Book of Kingdoms," *JBL* 112 (1993): 43–54; Koch, *Die Schrift als Zeuge des Evangeliums*, 73–77. As for Romans 12:19, Paul's quotation from Deut 32:35 shows exactly the same wording as that in Heb 10:30; cf. Martin Karrer's contribution to this volume, pp. 335–53.

knowledge of the Scriptures and modified the wording of a given reference only in order to adapt it to his argument. One difficulty remains, though. With regard to allusions, such a process of adaptation might have also included a rewording in order to adjust a given phrase to Paul's use of language. For example, in the probable allusion to Isa 56:1 in Rom 13:11, we cannot tell whether the noun ἡ σωτηρία and the adjective ἐγγύς—both common words in Paul's writings—were first worked into the quote by Paul or were already included in the text from which he cites.³⁵

Table 17. Romans 13:11 and sources

Isa 56:1	Symmachus [86]	Rom 13:11	Isa 56:1
כה אמר יהוה		Καὶ τοῦτο εἰδότες τὸν καιρὸν, ὅτι ὥρα	Τάδε λέγει κύριος
שמרו משפט		ἤδη ὑμᾶς ἐξ ὕπνου	φυλάσσεσθε κρίσιν
ועשו צדקה		ἐγερθῆναι, νῦν	ποιήσατε δικαιοσύνην·
כי־קרובה ישועתי לבוא ...	ἐγγύς γάρ ἡ σωτηρία τοῦ ἐλθεῖν	γάρ ἐγγύτερον ἡμῶν ἡ σωτηρία ἢ ὅτε ἐπιστεῦσαμεν.	ἤγγισεν γάρ τὸ σωτήριόν μου παραγίνεσθαι
Thus says the LORD: Maintain justice, and do what is right, for soon my salvation will come,		Besides this you know what hour it is, how it is full time now for you to wake from sleep. For salvation is nearer to us now than when we first believed.	This is what the Lord says: Keep judgment, do righteousness, for my salvation has drawn near to arrive....

Therefore, allusions cannot be used as evidence of a particular wording of a scripture reference. Apart from that, however, they too can shed light on the developmental history of the Septuagint text.

This applies, above all, to the immediate context of a scriptural citation. Let me give just one example. In Rom 2:24, the quotation from Isa 52:5 is used as

³⁵ On this allusion, see Wilk, *Die Bedeutung des Jesajabuches für Paulus*, 329–30.

an answer to the question asked in Rom 2:23: “Do you, while priding yourself on the law, dishonor God by transgressing the law?”³⁶

Table 18. Romans 2:23–24 and sources

Isa 52:5	Aquila/ Symmachus [86]	Rom 2:23–24	Isa 52:5
ועתה מִי־לִי־פָה			καὶ νῦν τί ὠδέ έστε;
נאם־יהוה		ὃς ἐν νόμῳ	τάδε λέγει κύριος.
כִּי־לִקְךָ		καυχᾶσαι,	ὅτι ἐλήμφθη
עמי חנם		διὰ τῆς παραβάσεως	ὁ λαός μου
משלך	οἱ ἐξουσιάζοντες	τοῦ νόμου	δωρεάν,
יהיליך	αὐτοῦ	τὸν θεόν	θαυμάζετε
נאם־יהוה	παρανομοῦσιν	ἀτιμάζεις·	καὶ ὀλολύζετε·
		τὸ γὰρ ὄνομα τοῦ	τάδε λέγει κύριος.
		θεοῦ	
וחמיד כל־היום		δι' ὑμᾶς	δι' ὑμᾶς
שמי			διὰ παντός
מנאץ:		βλασφημεῖται	τὸ ὄνομά μου
		ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσιν,	βλασφημεῖται
		καθὼς γέγραπται.	ἐν τοῖς ἔθνεσι.
Now therefore what am I doing here, says the LORD, seeing that my people are taken away without cause? Their rulers howl, says the LORD, and continually, all day long, my name is despised.		You that boast in the law, do you dishonor God by breaking the law? For, as it is written, 'The name of God is blasphemed among the Gentiles because of you.'	And now, why are you here? This is what the Lord says, Because my people were taken for nothing, you marvel and howl. This is what the Lord says, Because of you my name is continually blasphemed among the nations.

In the Septuagint version of Isa 52, however, the word νόμος does not occur at all. But if we compare other versions as well as the Hebrew parent text, it

³⁶ The modifications of the Septuagint text of Isa 52:5b and the chiasmic word order in Rom 2:23–24 serve to stress this interrelation.

becomes plausible that in Paul's scroll, the statement preceding the sentence quoted by him had roughly the same wording as that used by Aquila and Symmachus who both wrote about those with authority in Israel transgressing the law. Accordingly, Rom 2:23 again bears witness to a septuagintal text that had been reworked on the basis of the Hebrew.

Thus, the Pauline allusions to passages of Scripture should not be disregarded when examining his letters as witnesses to and for the Septuagint text.